

On the occasion of
ICOLD — 69TH ANNUAL MEETING DRESDEN



Preliminary
Proceedings

Symposium

**Benefits and Concerns
about Dams**

13th September 2001, Dresden



Organizer
German Committee on Large Dams

In cooperation with
Gesellschaft der Förderer
des Hubert-Engels-Instituts
für Wasserbau und Technische
Hydromechanik e. V., Dresden

Sponsored by

**Deutsche
Bundesstiftung
Umwelt**

P.O. Box 17 05 · 49007 Osnabrück





Organizing Committee

Dr.- Ing. Herbert Lütkestratkötter, President, DTK
Prof. Dr.-Ing. Peter Reißler, Vice President, DTK
Dr. Jörg Debelius, Secretary, DTK
Prof. h.c. Prof. Dr.-Ing. habil. Hans Bretschneider
Prof. Dipl.-Ing. Peter Franke
Univ. Prof. Dr.-Ing. habil. Jürgen Giesecke
Dipl.-Ing. Hans-Jürgen Glasebach
Univ. Prof. Dr.-Ing. habil. Hans-B. Horlacher
Dipl.-Ing. Roland Jurecka
Dipl.-Ing. Volker Jurowich
Univ. Prof. Dr.-Ing. Jürgen Königeter
Dipl.-Ing. Jens Peters
Dr.-Ing. Joachim Renner
Univ. Prof. Dr.-Ing. Theodor Strobl
Dr.-Ing. Dieter Stroh

Project Director

Dipl.-Ing. Jürgen Bertram

Publisher: German Committee on Large Dams
Graf-Recke-Straße 84
D-40239 Düsseldorf
Tel.: + 49 211-6214-499/-418 • Fax: + 49 211-6214-172 • E-mail: dtk@vdi.de

Druck: Bernhard GmbH, Wermelskirchen

Copyright: German Committee on Large Dams. All rights reserved



Preface

The glamorous days of unlimited barrage construction are definitely gone. Initiated by the industrial countries but nowadays spread world-wide, dam builders are increasingly facing opposition from many sources. The bandwidth extends from the well-meaning selfless environmentalist who tries to protect a certain region, to the powerful international organisations which support their goals with such ideology. The supporters have watched this situation in silence for too long, assuming that the constructions and the resulting benefits would speak for themselves. The ensuing confrontation easily ends up in complete deadlock, which benefits no-one.

As a promoter and agent of dam construction, ICOLD can no longer ignore the situation and must face up to it – which it is doing. This cannot, however, merely be limited to the presentation of the advantages but must also include knowledge and examination of the objections. We know insufficient about the counter-arguments, especially when they are of a non-technical nature.

The presentation of the final report of the World Commission on Dams (WCD) in November 2000 was an excellent opportunity to let representatives of the anti-dam movement speak in a symposium in order to help others understand their position and discuss it in an open, factual and objective manner. Both sides can learn from each other and thus master this difficult situation.

In three sessions, the WCD's point of view and the pros and cons of dam construction will be presented by invited speakers and then discussed. It is the first time since the publication of WCD's final report to discuss the report with an open and international audience. That is why we highly esteem these contributions from the floor.

Therefore this volume contains only the invited lectures in order to assist the audience and to stimulate a vital discussion. After the Annual Meeting a comprehensive and well-shaped volume will be published as proceedings of the symposium, including the final lectures and all the questions and answers. It is our strong intention that this proceedings may serve in the future as state-of-the-art for the integration of dams into water resources management and natural and social environment.

The organizing committee deeply acknowledges the invited lecturers for their kind assistance and contribution to this unique symposium.

Organizing Committee
August 2001

Contents

Organizing Committee	2
Preface	3
Welcome Addresses	
Herbert Lütkestratkötter	6
Chairman of the German Committee on Large Dams	
C.V.J. Varma *	
President ICOLD	
Achim Mehlhorn	7
Rector of the Dresden University of Technology	
Ingolf Roßberg	8
Mayor of Dresden	
Steffen Flath	9
Minister for Agriculture and the Environment of the Free State of Saxony	
Symposium	
From Politicians to Craftsmen: How ICOLD Can Use the WCD's Dams & Development as a Pragmatic Tool	12
<i>Prof. Kader Asmal</i> , Minister of Education South Africa, former WCD Chair	
Conclusions of the German Government *	
<i>Heidmarie Wieczorek-Zeul</i> , Federal Minister for Economic Co-operation and Development	
Dams and Development – The Evolving Role of the World Bank	19
<i>Alessandro Palmieri</i> , Senior Dams Specialist, The World Bank	
The NGO's View *	
<i>Barbara Unmüßig</i> , WEED – World Economy, Ecology & Development	
The ICOLD Position(s) on the WRD Report – An Explanation	31
<i>Harry L. Blohm</i> , Vice President, Montgomery Watson Harza, and Past President USSD	
Opportunities in Development and Management of Water Resources	40
<i>Arthur H. Walz, jr.</i> , President, United States Society on Dams	
German Experience With Social and Environmental Issues Related to Dams	53
<i>Prof. Dr. Harro Bode/Prof. Dr. Peter Rißler</i> , Ruhrverband Essen	
The WCD Report With Respect to China's Dams	60
<i>Zhang Jinsheng</i> , Vice president CHINCOLD	
Turkish Position Against WCD Report	72
<i>Mümtaz Turfan</i> , Chairman of TRCOLD, General Directorate of State Hydraulic Works (DSI)	
The Indian Position to the WCD-Report *	
<i>Dr. M. Gopalakrishnan</i> , Chief Engineer, Central Water Commission, New Delhi	
"Dam and Development" in Nepalese Context	78
<i>Dr. Janak L. Karmacharya</i> , Executive Member, Nepal Commission on Large Dams	
Benefits and Concerns About Dams in Spain	88
<i>Prof. Luis Berga</i> , Chairman, Spanish National Committee on Large Dams, SPANCOLD	

* Paper not yet available



The International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) is a non-profit organization of economists and other professionals who are interested in the application of economic theory and methods to the study of agricultural and rural development.

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

Welcome Addresses

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).

The IAAE is a member of the International Union of Pure and Applied Economics (IUPUI) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE). The IAAE is also a member of the International Association of Agricultural Economists (IAAE) and the International Union of Agricultural Economists (IUAE).